

**Bradford DCA Committee Meeting Minutes**

**Meeting held 1st October 2015 at the Central Division Club, Clayton Lane**

**Present:** S Scurfield, A Bak, D Barlow, K Khan, K Marsh

**Apologies:** L Crawford, W Lilburn-Quick, C Wood

**1. Previous month’s meeting minutes**

N/A

**2. Matters Arising**

None

**3. Secretary’s Report**

Nothing to report further to item 7.

**4. Competition controller’s Report**

Individual Lightning received 33 entries. Mark Crowther and Dave Barlow shared 1st place and Karim Khan finished 3rd.

The Keith Trobridge Rapidplay was well attended with many prizes awarded. Peter Shaw won and 2nd place was shared by two new players to the league, Stefan Camarascu and Ganeshbabu Gnanagurusamy.

The Parkinson draw was delayed due to a rearranged match. Ludi Simpson and Ian Jewsbury were drawn to face each other. Ludi is away on holiday and asked for the match to be rearranged which Ian refused. It was decided that Ludi would receive a half-point bye and Ian a full-point bye.

Due to low numbers in the Hutchinson, KK is considering submitting a proposal to reduce the number of competitions to three while retaining the Bak trophy for the best U100 player in the bottom section.

**5. Website Editor’s Report**

Nothing to report.

**6. Treasurer’s Report**

Paid last year’s Division 1 ECF Game Fee bill of £144. The BDCA paid for occasional players particularly from Keighley and Bradford. The remainder of the bill will be footed by the clubs. It was noted that Ilkley had particularly high ECF game fee bills.

Paid Congress ECF bill of £203. This was slightly better than expected but still left the Congress at a loss of around £100.

There was still a problem of people claiming the discounted entry and not becoming ECF members which costs the Congress twice as they claim the discount and we then have to foot the game fee bill anyway. A zero-tolerance policy was discussed whereby you have to prove ECF membership to claim the discount, but with the Congress being so early on in the season, this might prove to be quite harsh.

The ECF does provide a grace period for players to become ECF members, Dave Barlow didn’t receive the final ECF game fee bill until December.

Stuart Swire had not yet sent the 2016 Congress entry form to be posted on BDCA & ECF calendars. DB to chase.

**7. Keighley Clough Appeal**

See attached letter dated 27th November 2015 for details of the match in question.

Keighley notified AB of their intention to appeal although nobody was available to attend this meeting. Their appeal was based on the fact that they had tried to act in good faith by making sure the players were in order of playing strength and that the penalty was very harsh for the offence.

There was extensive discussion relating to the overall spirit of the rules and of the BDCA as a whole against the black and white rules that had potentially been breached.

Ultimately it was decided by a majority of 3-2 that the AB’s ruling would be reversed and the original result would be reinstated (Keighley winning 4-2) with the following caveats:

1. Keighley would be given a written warning and reminded that the Clough rules indicate that players must be played in strict grading order. Advice on ungraded players can be given by the Secretary and adjusted grades can be awarded where appropriate.
2. The Committee respects the decision of the Secretary and it was correct that he applied the rules strictly in the first instance.
3. The issue of ungraded players in the Clough would be reviewed before the next AGM.

**8. AOB**

**a) Captains intervening during games & FIDE rules**

An incident occurred in the league where an illegal move was made and the question was brought up of when captains are allowed to intervene during a game. It was thought that the FIDE rules indicated that without an arbiter present, then captains can act as arbiters and act accordingly but this may need further examination.

On a side note, the new FIDE rules indicate that two illegal moves in a game lead to an automatic loss and this would apply in games in the Bradford League as we have no rules contradicting this.

In the Yorkshire league it was ruled that a player is automatically defaulted if their phone goes off during a game as this is the penalty in the FIDE rules and is not contradicted by their rules. The same could apply in Bradford and this will also need reviewing for the next AGM.

**b) Aire and Wharfe League**

Andrew Wainwright has established a new Aire and Wharfe League. This is a series of three Thursday nights in February, March and April with all games taking place in Menston.

He has asked the BDCA for financial assistance. The Committee felt that this request could not be honoured because the league was explicitly separate from the BDCA and it was unclear what the money would be used for.

**Meeting Closed**

Next meeting scheduled for Thursday 4th February 2016, Central Div WMC 8pm.



27th November 2015

To all concerned,

**Re: Clough Round 2 – Keighley Knights vs Wibsey Woodpushers**

In the above match, Keighley played the following board order:

Board 1: Paul Day (151)

Board 2: John Nuttall (90)

Board 3: Mahboob Nawaz (ug – 100)

Board 4: Chris Watson (67)

Keighley correctly assigned Mahboob Nawaz with a grade of 100 for an ungraded player following rule 59.

Rule 57 states that “boards should be played in grade order…” Keighley failed to follow this rule by playing Nawaz below Nuttall. Therefore Keighley lose all their game points from board 2 downwards and these points are awarded to the opposing team. However as Wibsey defaulted board 4, that result will be scored as 0-0. Therefore the scorecard for this match is as follows (also see attached spreadsheet)

Keighley Knights vs Wibsey Woodpushers

Paul Day 0-1 Dave Barlow

John Nuttall 0-1 Stephen Brown

Mahboob Nawaz 0-1 Wil Lilburn-Quick

Chris Watson 0-0 Default

Handicap 2-0 Handicap

**Final Score 2-3**

(NB. The original results of the games played will still be used for grading purposes)

It is regrettable that Keighley did not approach me before the round indicating that they wished to play an ungraded player below John Nuttall. Under Rule 62, I can potentially assign a grade to an ungraded player in the interests of fairness of the competition. However I could not make such a determination based on only three previous games on Chessnuts.

I would be grateful if you could reply to confirm receipt of this letter. If you wish to appeal against this decision, please let me know in writing by Saturday 5th December and a time can be arranged for the appeal to be heard before the Committee.

Regards,

Andrew Bak (Hon. Secretary)